IN THE NORTHAMPTON (CCBC) COUNTY COURT B E T W E E N:-

Claim No: 0QZ38178

MR ROB JOHNSON

<u>Claimant</u>

-and-

O2 TELEFONICA UK LIMITED

Defendant

DEFENCE

Introduction

 The Defendant is not properly named on the Claim Form. The Defendant is 'O2 Telefonica UK Limited'.

- 2. The Claimant entered into a contract with the Defendant on 16th October 2009. The contract was for the supply of, *inter alia*, airtime services and the supply of a mobile telephone. The contract was for 18 months.
- 3. The contract between the parties is contained within The Consumer & Business Customer Pay terms and conditions ('the terms and conditions') and is appended to this Defence [exhibit 1].
- 4. Under the terms of the contract between the parties, the Claimant was supplied with a mobile telephone known as 'Palm Pré'. This mobile telephone is 'exclusive' to the Defendant, meaning that it is not marketed or supplied by any other mobile telephone provider.

5. The Claimant refers to the 'unlocking' of a mobile telephone. 'Unlocking' a mobile telephone allows a user to use the mobile telephone on any mobile telephone network, rather than being limited to using it on a single mobile telephone network.

The substantive Defence

- 3. Paragraph 1 of the Particulars of Claim is admitted.
- 4. The Defendant is unable to admit or deny the contents of paragraph 2 of the Particulars of Claim. The Claimant is put to strict proof in relation to all allegations made regarding any representations, statements or otherwise made by the Defendant, its servants or agents. Notwithstanding the Claimant's need to prove all allegations made, the Defendant avers that the written terms and conditions form the whole of the contract between the parties and any representations, statements or otherwise made by the Defendant do not constitute terms and/or conditions of the contract between the parties. Further and in the alternative, the Defendant denies any misrepresentation as alleged or at all.
- 5. Paragraph 3 of the Particulars of Claim is admitted, insofar as it is admitted that the clause 5.9 of the terms and conditions states that 'Where a Handset is restricted to use on the Network we reserve the right to apply a charge for releasing or unlocking the Handset. Details of the charge are available by calling Customer Services'. It is admitted that the Claimant spoke with Customer Services. The Claimant telephoned Customer Services on 3rd November 2010 and 4th November 2010. The Claimant was informed on both occasions that the mobile telephone could not be unlocked as it was 'exclusive' to the Defendant.
- 6. Paragraph 4 of the Particulars of Claim is admitted.
- 7. Paragraph 5 of the Particulars of Claim expresses the Claimant's opinion, to which the Defendant is unable to plead. Notwithstanding this, it is admitted that the

Defendant will not unlock the mobile telephone as it is 'exclusive' to the Defendant. The Defendant avers the following:

- a. The terms and conditions, including clause 5.9 as set out above, do not impose an obligation on the Defendant to unlock a mobile telephone;
- b. The Defendant advertises the mobile telephone as 'exclusive' to the Defendant in both its printed and online literature;
- c. The Defendant advertises that the mobile telephone will not be unlocked;
- d. The Defendant clearly states on its website [exhibit 2] that the model of mobile telephone owned by the Claimant will not be unlocked so that customers can have 'the very best Smartphone experience'.
- 8. Paragraph 6 of the Particulars of Claim is admitted, in that the Defendant admits that the Claimant made such requests.

<u>Remedies</u>

- 9. The Claimant seeks the following remedies:
 - a. The Defendant unlocks the mobile telephone; or,
 - b. The Defendant provides the Claimant with an unlocked mobile telephone; or,
 - c. The Defendant pays the Claimant the sum of £456.
- 10. As to 9(a) and (b), the Defendant repeats the contents of paragraph 7 above.
- 11. As to 9(c), the Defendant avers that the Claimant is not entitled to claim £456 in the event that the Defendant is found liable, which is denied. The Claimant claims £96, being the cost of the mobile telephone, as well as the total amount of money paid per month under the terms of his contract.
- 12. The Defendant avers that the measure of damages is incorrect. The Defendant relies on clause 3 of the terms and conditions, which states that the duration of the contract is for the 'Minimum Period'. The 'Minimum Period' is defined in clause 14 of the terms and conditions. The duration of the contract between the parties was 18

months. During this period, the Claimant was required to pay the Defendant monthly instalments of ± 20 , as per clause 8.3 of the terms and conditions. The Claimant cannot be entitled to monies which he would have been required to pay the Defendant in any event.

- 13. Further and in the alternative, the Claimant has had the use of the mobile telephone and the Claimant's mobile telephone network. The Claimant would significantly better his position should damages be assessed on the basis pleaded. The Defendant notes that the Claimant did not contact the Defendant to request the unlocking of his mobile telephone for a period of 13 months.
- 14. The Defendant has made attempts to resolve the dispute between the parties. As a gesture of goodwill, the Defendant has credited the Claimant's account with a month's free line rental. Such a gesture is not to be construed as an admission of liability.

GARETH SHIRES

Dated this day of

2010

Statement of Truth

The Defendant believes that the facts stated in this Defence are true. I am duly authorised by the Defendant to sign this Defence.

Signed <u>HALLEGAL</u> HL WHITEHEAD Position or office held. LEGAL COUNSES

Legal Department, Telefonica O2 UK Limited, 260 Bath Road, Slough, Berkshire SL1 4DX Exhibit1 is the full contract. This doesn't have much of interest in it, so I didn't bother to scan it.

_

EXHI		y O2 mobile	to use it on a	a different netwo	rk? - Support - O2	Page 1 of 1
- 1111						
				2 mobile to use it on a differe	nt network?	
		/ O2 mobile to use	e it on a different	t network?		
	If you have an O2 iPho	one click <u>here</u> d Pay & Go customers				
	If you're a Pay Monthi- only exception are har	y customer then you can	in request for your hand	lset to be unlocked at any tim alm which remain locked to th	e, free of charge. The e O2 network as we	
		Fildre the very beat off	antpriorie experience.	mum term of your contract e		
		ustomer, your O2 mobil me balance.	e can be unlocked 12 m	nonths after purchase for a on	e-off £15 fee which we'll	
	For Business Custon					
	If you're the main accore exception are handset customers to have the	ount holder you can req s which are exclusive to every best Smartphone	uest for your devices to O2 such as the Palm w experience.	be unlocked at any time, fre hich remain locked to the O2	e of charge. The only network as we want our	
	,, p	-		inimum term of your contract	even if you place a non-	
				e requested information.		
	how to unlock.	Inly or Pay & Go (subject	ct to acceptance) we'll r	respond via email within 7 day	s with the details on	
	Related Links					
	Online Shop Unblock My Mobile					
	Did this informat	tion answer your	question?			
		s what you think	Share		,	
	Try again				a and a second sec	
	Start a new search Email us					
	<u>Call us</u> Ask a question in o	ur forums				
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 I	UK Limited. Terms & Conditions
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. Terms & Conditions
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 t	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 t	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 (UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Conditions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>
					© 2010 Telefónica O2 U	UK Limited. <u>Terms & Condițions</u>

https://service.o2.co.uk/IO/SRVS/CGI-BIN/WEBCGI FXF/ /28t=379 F=0000000002 22/12/2010